

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) Elimination of the fourth floor as well as the applicant's willingness to work with the Commission is greatly appreciated. 2) Lower and push back the ridgeline/plate at the top of the third floor. 3) The Commission likes the Moorish detailing, but it must be simplified and more authentic. 4) Look to the Adamson House in Malibu for Moorish detailing. 5) A model may be helpful with respect to massing. 6) Pay attention to the large, massive building south of the project; do not emulate it. 7) Look to the Inn of the Spanish Garden for inspiration for massing. 8) Reduce the floor-to-floor heights, especially the garage level, to lower the overall height of the building. 9) Project should strive to be a great example for the block. 10) Restudy the two-story mirador.

Action: Pujo/Hsu, 8/0/0.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **7. 210 W CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:51) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025  
Application Number: MST2005-00772  
Owner: Old Town Mall  
Owner: Steve Delson  
Architect: Conceptual Motion

(Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of approximately 18,000 s.f. of commercial square footage and the construction of a new four-story, mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 14,604 square feet of commercial space, 57,989 square feet of residential space, 6,674 square feet of commercial live/work space, 555 square feet of residential accessory space, and two levels of underground parking. There will be a total of 55 residential condominium units. A modification is requested for residential density on this 1.2 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

### **(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS, AND A MODIFICATION TO ALLOW BONUS DENSITY UNITS.)**

Present: Steve Yates, President of Conceptual Motion Company  
Gerhard Mayer, Architect from Conceptual Motion Company  
Steve Delson and Ian Brown, Owners  
Katie O'Reilly Rogers, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:10.

Mr. Kellam De Forest commented that the proposed project is too big for the lot size.

The following letters were read into the record by Chair Suding:

- 1) Jeffrey Paley, resident, expressed support for the project.
- 2) Robert Adams and Nancy Caponi, neighbors, showed numerous concerns relating to the proposed project including the impact that a large quantity of units would have on traffic, adequate open space available for the occupants, parking in the surrounding neighborhoods, and the massing of a four-story structure in the El Pueblo Viejo District.

Public comment closed

The Commission, either individually or collectively, had the following comments and/or suggestions:

- 1) The applicant's distinct presentation, great drawings, and images are greatly appreciated.
- 2) The size, bulk, and scale are of great concern; too much development is proposed on the site.
- 3) The paseos and affordable housing are greatly appreciated.
- 4) Four stories is not characteristic of Santa Barbara.
- 5) Draw inspiration from a village rather than from an urban center when considering size, bulk, and scale.
- 6) Street noise at the busy intersection is of concern.
- 7) Consider fewer paseos in favor of a larger central open space.
- 8) Study moving the taller elements away from the street.
- 9) Restudy the "ADA effect".

### FINAL REVIEW

8. 121 W DE LA GUERRA ST

C-2 Zone

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-002

Application Number: MST2004-00774

Owner: The Rametto Company

Applicant: Thomas Luria

Architect: Brian Cearnal

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,200 square foot office building and 65 car parking lot and construct 14 residential condominium units (three of which are affordable), a new 3,310 square foot office building and parking for 44 cars, all on a 22,500 square foot parcel in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 052-05.)**

Present: Brian Cearnal and Joe Andrulaitis, Architects

Motion: Final approval of the project and details to return in two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) Applicant is to return with an irrigation plan. 2) Return with lighting addressing the fluorescent fixture requirement and garage lighting for Commissioner Hausz to review. 3) Cover the exposed flashing shown on details 16 and 17 on Sheet A503. 4) The Commission recommends that the project also be reviewed and approved by the Architectural Board of Review.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

## 5. 210 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

**(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025

Application Number: MST2007-00554

Owner: Old Town Mall

Owner: Steve Delson

Architect: Conceptual Motion

(This is a revised project. Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of 18,547 square feet of commercial square footage and the construction of a new three-story mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 12,851 square feet (net) of commercial space, 45,422 square feet (net) of residential space and two levels of underground parking with 122 parking spaces. There will be a total of 31 residential condominium units (27 market rate and 4 affordable). A modification to allow the 4 bonus density affordable units is requested. The project site is a 1.17 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The previous proposal under MST2005-00772 has been withdrawn.)

**(Second Concept Review.)****(COMMENTS ONLY, PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND A MODIFICATION TO ALLOW BONUS DENSITY UNITS.)**

Present: Steve Yates, Gerhard Mayer, and Dan Weber, Conceptual Motion  
Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect  
Kathleen Kennedy, City Assistant Planner

Public comment opened at 3:44 p.m.

Gil Barry, local resident, commented that he had disagreed with the previously proposed mass, bulk, and scale, but now commends the following changes made by the applicant: 1) buildings are not to exceed 40 feet in height and 2) three-story elements are set back from the property line. He commented that four-story buildings should not be allowed – not even in the center of the property.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, commented that, although the new proposal is a great improvement, it may still be too big to be compatible with the other historic structures in the area and with the one and two-story buildings to the north. The large plaza on the corner of De La Vina and Carrillo Streets in the original proposal was a plus. It would be nice to have a transition between the historic victorian on De La Vina Street and the complex. Canopy trees would be better than palm trees on Carrillo Street to help screen the structure and provide shade for pedestrians. He questioned how the round stone bollards could fit into El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

Lincoln Gray, representative of the property to the north, expressed support for the currently proposed project, but expressed concern with the proposed three-story building shadowing his property's garden area at the north property line. The other architectural problem is the back wall that is too low at a certain section, raising privacy issues.

Public comment closed at 3:50 p.m.

- Motion:** Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The majority of the Commissioners feel that the corner needs more work and would like to see it accented in a traditional way. 2) As the plan gets massaged, the open areas (patios) should be increased in size. 3) Substantial landscaping should be provided on and around the perimeter of the site. 4) The project should be pulled back from the neighborhood to the north. 5) On De La Vina Street, as it transitions to the residential neighborhood, the building should be setback from the sidewalk to allow for landscaping, increasing setbacks as it approaches the residence to the immediate north. 6) The architecture is generally acceptable, but more simplicity in the articulation and materials is desired. 7) Elements in the design are supportable, such as the breakup of the building along De La Vina Street and the substantial reduction in the building, although some Commissioners expressed concern that it is still too large. 8) Parts of the design are supportable, particularly the idea of paseos and the breakup of the building mass, but needs further refinement to be more credible in an Andalusian interpretation. 9) It looks as if the courtyards were designed around the buildings, not the buildings around the courtyards. 10) Would like to see a three-dimensional model or computer module, with shadow studies off and on the project, along with the simple massing of adjacent buildings up to half the block. 11) Pay attention to the design of the bridges. The bridge design on De La Vina Street is particularly nice, but the one off Carrillo Street is problematic. 12) Provide a focused letter report identifying the date the residence was constructed and an analysis of the impact of this structure on the potential historic resource (a full survey/report on each of the buildings is not needed at this time).
- Action:** Boucher/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Adams/Sharpe stepped down.) Motion carried.

### CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 203 CHAPALA ST

R-4/SD-3 Zone

(4:27)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-001  
Application Number: MST2007-00634  
Owner: Sanders Family 2006 Revocable Trust  
Owner: Richard Sanders  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal to demolish 9,909 square feet of an existing 11,211 square foot commercial building and construct a new three story, 11,884 square foot addition for a total project area of 13,186 square feet. The existing commercial use would be changed to eight residential condominium units consisting of four 3-bedroom units, two 2-bedroom units, and two 1-bedroom units. The maximum building height would be 37'-0". Parking on this 20,553 square foot parcel would be provided in eight private garages, two carports, and two uncovered parking spaces, with two guest parking spaces also being provided. Planning Commission approval will be required for a tentative subdivision map, a Coastal Development Permit, and approval of a condominium development.)

(Second Concept Review.)

**(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)**

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect  
Diana Kelly, Project Manager

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

## 5. 210 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

**(3:07)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025  
Application Number: MST2007-00554  
Owner: Old Town Mall  
Owner: Steve Delson  
Architect: Conceptual Motion

(This is a revised project. Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of 18,547 square feet of commercial square footage and the construction of a new three-story mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 12,851 square feet (net) of commercial space, 45,422 square feet (net) of residential space and two levels of underground parking with 122 parking spaces. There will be a total of 31 residential condominium units (27 market rate and 4 affordable). A modification to allow the 4 bonus density affordable units is requested. The project site is a 1.17 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The previous proposal under MST2005-00772 has been withdrawn.)

**(Review of focused Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. The report identifies potential historic resources adjacent to the site and potential impacts of the proposed project on those resources.)**

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the conclusion of the preparer of the report is that the proposed project would not have a negative impact on the neighborhood.

Public comment opened at 3:08 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, requested information to be included in the report as to the buildings across the street from the proposed project.

Ms. Gantz acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury with comments about the report and in opposition to the project.

Public comment closed at 3:10 p.m.

**Motion: To accept the report with the comment that not all Commissioners agree with the findings as to the size, bulk, and scale of the project relative to the adjacent buildings and neighborhood.**

**Action:** Hausz/Murray, 5/1/0. (Naylor opposed. Adams/Sharpe stepped down. La Voie absent.)  
Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

## 6. 210 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

**(3:22)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025

Application Number: MST2007-00554

Owner: Old Town Mall

Owner: Steve Delson

Architect: Conceptual Motion

(This is a revised project. Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of 18,547 square feet of commercial square footage and the construction of a new three-story mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 12,851 square feet (net) of commercial space, 45,422 square feet (net) of residential space and two levels of underground parking with 122 parking spaces. There will be a total of 31 residential condominium units (27 market rate and 4 affordable). A modification to allow the 4 bonus density affordable units is requested. The project site is a 1.17 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The previous proposal under MST2005-00772 has been withdrawn.)

**(Third Concept Review.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY, PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND A MODIFICATION TO ALLOW BONUS DENSITY UNITS.)**

Present: Steve Yates and Gerhard Mayer, Conceptual Motion

Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect

Kathleen Kennedy, City Assistant Planner

Public comment opened at 4:05 p.m.

Lincoln Gray, owner of adjacent property, commented that the new design is acceptable and would ultimately improve the neighborhood, but an increase in the height of any of the proposed buildings would not be appropriate.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, commented that the Planning Commission's input would have been helpful during the Historic Landmarks Commission's review. He commended the applicant for resisting the desire to have more affordable units, avoiding the need to increase the height of the buildings to the center of the site. Mr. De Forest questioned what would be, from an esthetic point of view, the purpose of the building shown on the plans going into the lower plaza.

Public comment closed at 4:13 p.m.

**Motion:** Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The applicant's presentation and the response to previous comments made by the Commission is appreciated, although the changes are not significant as were seen in a previous presentation. 2) The Commission is not ready to make neighborhood compatibility findings until a physical or computer model is provided showing the project and its relationship to the neighborhood. 3) The Commission does not find a fourth story acceptable, although the applicant is not proposing a fourth story at this time. 4) The perimeter landscape proposed is found to be generally acceptable, but the Commission would like to see additional plantings in the courtyards and *paseos*. 5) A simplification of the architecture and a consistency within each separate building would be preferred. 6) The open plaza at the corner is supportable. 7) There is concern that the interior courtyards are too small relative to the heights of the buildings.

**Action:** Hausz/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Adams/Sharpe stepped down. La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION TOOK A BREAK FROM 4:53 P.M. TO 5:01 P.M. \*\***

### CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

7. 129 E ANAPAMU ST

C-2 Zone

**(5:01)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-121-013

Application Number: MST2008-00039

Owner: Bella Anapamu Properties, LLC

Applicant: Mike Calderón

Contractor: Channel Coast Corporation

Business Name: Elements Restaurant

(Proposal to remove deteriorating post, beam, and trellis on the front porch and replace with new post and beam and vinyl lattice cover with retractable canvas awning over the exterior patio. The proposal also includes the installation of five exterior hanging gas heaters and new light fixtures.)

**(Referred to Full Board from Consent for Second Concept Review.)**

**Present:** Jesse Walz, Channel Coast Corporation

Public comment opened at 5:09 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, stated that this structure is across the street from a National Landmark: the Santa Barbara County Court House. He suggested more historical information be provided about this building. Mr. De Forest commented that it needs to break into the ambience of the streetscape.

Public comment closed at 5:10 p.m.

**Motion:** Continued indefinitely to allow applicant to redesign the proposal.

**Action:** Boucher/Adams, 8/0/0. (La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners agree with the motion previously made at the February 20<sup>th</sup> meeting? (i.e., the landscape plan should be proposed for the same number of trees as previously existed on the site, with adequate foundation planting, and framing and screening of the building.) 6/0.

How many Commissioners would agree to allow a different location of the replacement trees somewhere in the front of the building? 6/0.

How many Commissioners feel comfortable with the amount of street trees that exist? 6/0.

**Motion:** Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) Provide a landscape plan indicating the replacement of three trees as previously existed on the site, not necessarily the same species. The plan should show that landscaping will mitigate the appearance of the nonconforming handrail. 2) Provide additional foundation planting for the framing and screening of the building.

**Action:** Sharpe/Adams, 6/0/1. (Hausz abstained. Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comments in reviewing the plans dated May 23, 2005: The handrails along the handicap ramp shown on the plans that were approved by the Commission were existing. The current handrails appear to match and they are indicated as 2 inch round handrails, with no change. The handrails along the south corner of the porch were also indicated as existing handrails, with no change, and were drawn as a typical top and bottom rail with vertical pickets, and do not have the extensions required for handicap access. The handrail design on the ramp would not have been approved by the Commission in the past twelve years. (It was noted that this change was not made by the current property owner.) The plans indicate existing landscape with no change. The landscape for the parking lot was indicated as requested.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:34 P.M. TO 4:42 P.M. \*\***

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

9. 210 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

**(4:42)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025

Application Number: MST2007-00554

Owner: Old Town Mall

Owner: Steve Delson

Architect: Conceptual Motion

(This is a revised project. Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of 18,547 square feet of commercial square footage and the construction of a new three-story mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 12,851 square feet (net) of commercial space and two levels of underground parking with 122 parking spaces. There will be a total of 32 residential condominium units (27 market rate and 5 affordable). A modification to allow the 5 bonus density affordable units is requested. The project site is a 1.17 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The previous proposal under MST2005-00772 has been withdrawn.)

**(Fourth Concept Review.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY, PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND A MODIFICATION TO ALLOW BONUS DENSITY UNITS.)**

Present: Steve Yates, Gerhard Mayer, and Dan Weber, Conceptual Motion  
Steve Delson and Ian Brown, Owners  
Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 5:07 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the project's mass and felt that it should not imitate downtown State Street. He suggested that there be a mix of heights, and the plaza on the street should be more formal and square.

Public comment closed at 5:09 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners feel that the project is fine the way it is being proposed? 5/0.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:**

**1)** What is liked about the project is the strength of the design and its simplicity. It is the hope of the Commission that, as the project develops, it does not get overly fussy in an attempt to try to disguise the mass of the building, which has so far been avoided. Stay in that direction. **2)** The building mass along De La Vina Street is acceptable. **3)** The project is compatible with the neighborhood. **4)** The portion of the building immediately adjacent to the neighborhood to the north needs to be more articulated to bring the building more in scale with the majority of the buildings in the neighborhood. **5)** There remains a concern about the size of courtyards and landscaping provision. **6)** The large building mass in the center should be articulated. **7)** The building mass towards the corner needs to read as a separate building as opposed to an appendage to the large building. **8)** The roof line needs to be modulated so that the building does not have a general appearance of uniform mass. **9)** Significant corners need to be celebrated. **10)** The design and resolution of the corner open space needs further refinement so that it is expressed as a public open space. **11) Regarding the impact to the potential historic resources to the north: a)** A mitigation of the mass of that portion of the building would be an adequate mitigation of any impact to the neighborhood to the north. **b)** Any potential impacts can be mitigated by a modification of the existing design. **12)** Presentations were made indicating the solar access has minimal impact on the adjoining residential neighborhood.

Action: Naylor/Hausz, 5/0/0. (Adams/Sharpe stepped down. Murray/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

G. Adjournment.

**Motion: To adjourn the meeting.**

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 5/0/0. (Adams/Murray/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

## 1. 210 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

**(1:57)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025  
Application Number: MST2007-00554  
Owner: Old Town Mall  
Owner: Steve Delson and Ian Brown  
Architect: Conceptual Motion

(This is a revised project. Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of 18,547 square feet of commercial square footage and the construction of a new three-story mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 12,851 square feet (net) of commercial space and two levels of underground parking with 122 parking spaces. There will be a total of 32 residential condominium units (27 market rate and 5 affordable). A modification to allow the 5 bonus density affordable units is requested. The project site is a 1.17 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The previous proposal under MST2005-00772 has been withdrawn.)

**(Review of revised focused Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. The report identifies potential historic resources adjacent to the site and potential impacts of the proposed project on those resources.)**

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
Steve Yates, Architect  
Debra Andaloro, City Senior Planner

A discussion was held as to the process of the Commission accepting Historic Structures Reports.

Staff comments: Debra Andaloro, Senior Planner, clarified Staff's role and responsibility when environmental reviews are conducted in conjunction with the review of an historic structures report. Ms. Andaloro requested that, in the future, the Commission clearly articulate the reasons the Commission does not agree with the Historic Structures Report's conclusions, although the report itself may be accepted.

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the Historic Structures Report's conclusion that the proposed project would have a less than significant impact on the surrounding neighborhood as a Class III impact. He commented that the Commission has the right to conclude that it would have a Class I or Class II impact.

Public comment closed at 2:31 p.m.

**Motion:** To accept the report with the condition to strike the timeline on page 3, found in the last paragraph under the recommended mitigation measures.

**Action:** Hausz/Naylor, 5/0/1. (Murray abstained. Adams/Sharpe stepped down. Pujo absent.)  
Motion carried.